

FINAL COPY
APrIGF 2017
Bangkok, Thailand
JULY 29, 2017
CLOSING PLENARY
3:48 PM

Services provided by:
Caption First, Inc.
P.O. Box 3066
Monument, CO 80132
1-877-825-5234
+001-719-481-9835
Www.captionfirst.com

This text is being provided in a rough draft format. Communication Access Realtime Translation (CART) is provided in order to facilitate communication accessibility and may not be a totally verbatim record of the proceedings.

>> PAUL WILSON: Good afternoon. Thank you very much for coming back to this closing session of the APrIGF of 2017, the eighth APrIGF. My name's Paul Wilson. I'm with a group of people who put some work into putting this event together in terms of this program and structure and preparations and things like fellowship committees -- and again, the host of the -- APrIGF secretariats and has done the heavy lifting. And the part of this session this afternoon.

Just to give us a chance to recap on what's been discussed, what's been -- what's come up, what our thoughts have been on all of the sessions that have happened in this year's event. I'm sure we all recall -- of 2017 but to remind us all, access, empowerment, and diversity, cyber security, privacy and safer internet. Number three, digital economy and enabling invasion. No. 4, human rights online. In addition, we also have youth internet governance forum, the development of the synthesis document, and -- legislators.

So when we planned this session, we were just going to have a series of reports on each of those things, but instead of just having a series of reports, we decided to mix it up a little bit and make it more interactive, too, so please be ready to interact **Fe** interact and continue the interaction. Most -- APrIGF event who are -- volunteered or being voluntold to come along and share their thoughts on --

So we'll start off by -- to lead or report back on each of the seven sessions and what -- couple of minutes and then share -- with colleagues who -- in terms of -- that will contribute to just recapping and looking back on what we've seen in the past few days. And there's -- on the screen, as well. So I think -- trying to capture some of the tweeted comments that come up on the board here. And everyone, also tweet along with us. And whatever you say, I'll be aware will go straight

up on the screen here and be shared with the world. But hopefully, we'll have a passing reactor of thing to watch -- listen to the --

So I'm assisted here starting to start with the first repertoire. So let's start out with Vashkar Bhattacharjee here. He's in the group of access, empowerment and diversity. Would you like to share your thoughts what you captured in the last few days? About two minutes.

>> VASHKAR BHATTACHARJEE: Okay. Ladies and gentlemen, can you see me? Believe me, I can't see you. We want to say God have given you opportunity. Ladies and gentlemen, last few days, we have discuss about the inclusion, accessibility, participation for the poor and marginalized groups, including women, children, and persons with disabilities. We have developing goals we need to achieve by 3030.

These goals have a clear vision: No one left behind. So I may have considered women rights, you must consider the rights of women with disabilities. Why am I talking about the children rights, we must consider the children with disabilities and their access. While we are talking about the indigenous peoples rights, why we are forgetting there is a community that is indigenous people with disabilities. If you exclude this community, then you need to get that again. If you exclud the community, then it would be an area for our -- we will not achieve as dizzy. So last few days, we discuss regarding equal access for society.

I cannot -- because is not accessible. I can use my smart phone because it is accessible. So ladies and gentlemen, we want -- without -- or everyone equally enjoy internet. So internet governance must be an inclusive one. Thank you very much.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PAUL WILSON: Thank you. Is Andrew here in the room? No, she's not here. Okay, we'll go to the next speaker, Mili Semlani. Just say your name and introduce your course. And then just pass the microphone along, okay? Thank you.

>> MILI SEMLANI: Hello, everyone. My name is Mili Semlani. First, I'd like to thank APrIGF secretariat to put this wonderful program together on behalf of all fellows and for giving us this opportunity to be here.

Since I'm pushing to make this platform simpler and easier for everyone, if there is any moment where I say anything that's complicated or difficult to understand, just raise your hadn't and I'll know, I'll try and simplify that. I promise not to use any acfilms from here on.

Trying to summarize the opinions of the access empowerment and diversity team, there are a few key issues that were pointed out. Firstly, with the routine we're dealing with, access in terms of infrastructure is limited because it's a remote, you know, continent, with lots of different kinds of land forms like from islands to high mountains. We've got everything. Physical infrastructure access is lacking still in a lot of places, which restricts access to internet in a lot of the societies living in these kind of inaccessible places

With respect to that, while we want to push for more access, we don't want it to come at the cost of freedom of speech, which is to say that the government should not -- should make sure that they're not giving us internet and, you know, high speed

facilities at the cost of taking away the freedom to say what we want.

And secondly, at the cost of mobilization by big businesses. While we want access and better infrastructure, we don't want big companies to rule that or monopolize that in specific countries, which goes to say that the cost for accessing internet should be a lot lower.

The other bad thing is internationalized domain names because languages in this region are multiple, the -- to make sure that internet can be accessed in different languages with domain names in regional languages to cater to the nonEnglish speaking population is something that we're working to. There are still debates on how this works fully because, yes, it goes against globalization slightly, while, you know, we are moving back to local, but we have to think of the people who really are not using English as their first or any language at all to talk to them in their own language.

Then coming to the good part, in terms of empowerment, we're moving towards more initiatives and we've seen a lot of different training programs for the youth. One of the them is the result of why we are here. So these youth programs are trying to bring in more and more young people to talk at these forums too, participate at internet governance related issues. So that's a good thing.

Challenges we really face are firstly, sustainability. What happens after the program ends? Where do they take all of this and contribute back to society? And secondly, when they do start local chapters, the kind of funding issues they could face. So these are a few issues identified with respect to this.

And lastly, about gender diversity, while it's improving in terms of access, it's still really poor in lot of countries where women simply do not have access to internet or infrastructure or a smart phone for that matter. And similarly with the different people, there are not enough technologies that aid their access or help them use it in a better way. Thank you.

>> PAUL WILSON: Can I just -- just to say thank you, that's the end of the first theme, and I just wanted to say thanks for some very pointed motivating remarks there. We do want to make this interactive, so if anyone would like to tweet or even stand at the mic and make a comment on this particular theme, then please just go ahead or line up at the mic and we'll recognize you. We've got a little bit of time. It's a fairly packed program, but please, if anyone would like to contribute, then just let me know. And do we have another speaker on the first?

>> PIRONGRONG RAMASOTA: Yeah, I just saw Anju walking in. Would you like to come up on the stage or give us a tweet from the microphone there? Or should we come back to you later?

>> ANJU MANGAL: Yeah.

>> PIRONGRONG RAMASOTA: So now we are moving on to cyber security privacy and safer internet. And Ali Hussain is here.

>> ALI HUSSAIN: Hello. I am Ali Hussain from Pakistan and first of all I would like to thank the APrIGF to give us the opportunity to come here and learn a lot of things which are really useful to understand. And in our something, we have -- and interviews. The first and mainly in our something in the workshops it was discussed about how the laws are being

made in the southeast Asia and south Asian countries and also discussed how these laws are being misused by the government and other agencies to -- reach into the privacy of the public. This is really a big concern and we should have aggressively find a solution and we should also think like how we can block the ill minded peoples to utilize the internet.

And also we have discussed -- enforce the IT security, how the management should build the capacity of the employers, and they should have -- for the incident response and the -- regards we have seen many like points during the workshop that -- the employers and certain -- the employers who follow. So this is also a main concern. And we also have a role play session in which was very good.

We discussed the main and the values and all -- possible options and -- has to be the policy to -- Taiwan has a good examples. They have recently the legislation and they have also the condition for other governments and also we wish -- and also for the -- misuse and abusive use of the internet and that has to take into account and internationalized e-mail addresses and domain names can be helpful so we can have the rest of 65-56 person to have the population to have the internet and this has to ensure to make the interest and address their concerns. And I have like -- we should have updated legislation regarding the cyber security and privacy and that has to be by the -- holder enforcement.

>> NUSRAT MEHAJABIN: I'm happy to be here learning various issues. Thanks for presenting and thinking nicely for our group. I just want to add little things with it. There are so many talks on encryption. Actually, the terms on cyber security itself, is sticky things and a lot of technical issues are rooted with this. The particular knowledge is record for the people for different organization stage who are running their business. I would like to **spatial** mention about the self-responsibility of end users which were consumer of the internet. I have students from China, some of their issues on internet -- in Bangkok. This is through an active participation in youth in the -- of inter governance. My sedition is that we must share our learning from here among the people of our community. So that they can be a -- they can be -- bad things of internet, as well.

Cyber security, it can never be on the technical issues and must contribute with each other to keep the internet safe because no organization can keep us safe unless and until we really want to be safe. Thank you. Thank you very much.

>> MOHAMMAD ABDUL AWAL: Very good afternoon, everyone. My colleagues have very much covered everything, so I want to highlight one thing. I was attending a cyber security role play workshop and in had there, I realized that technical team is one of the most vital team that needs to proactively take measures when there is a cyber -- in an organization. So we have folks working behind the machines, and we need to know what's happening inside those machines, who are actually the bad guys or bad things are actually in our house. So -- and I appreciate that ITF has that -- ITF maz increased that technology to consider secretive first when there is any protocol related activities going on there. So I think as a technical, we need to focus on the safety of the data that we have and that users who trusted us with their data need to be respected. Thank you.

>> PAUL WILSON: Thank you very much. Round of applause.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PAUL WILSON: And I see we have someone lining up for the microphone.

>> Thank you, Paul. From the cyber security sessions I lead, I want to share feedback I received from the participants. So from the role play, a lot of people said it was useful and interesting and there were a lot of innovations after the event to do similar things in their constituency or economy. I want to highlight the consent for that cyber security role play is available for free and if you are interested to get the **quants**, come see me or I will publish it somewhere, to organize and share it for the rest of the attendees. That is number one. We go to questions about basic cyber security. So I guess cyber security as a topic is huge. But there were a lot of requests for how to do certain things and how to secure things and how to do security within organizations so perhaps this is a content that can be considered in the future other than just talking about issues relate **toted** encryptions or internet shut downs and things like that, perhaps a separate track for those who need to know on how to secure things for their organization or for personal reasons.

The other thing that I would like to share is there was another session that we had about the role of search in improving security. So I would like to highlight that maybe the presence of the community -- security community in this event is not that much. We were lucky to have representatives from Thailand, Taiwan, and Tonga at this event, but I think there is a need to probably encourage more of this group of people from the technical community to come and engaged with a wider community because normally they just go to the technical events.

I would also like to note that I think the presence of the digital security clinic by access now, it's really, really useful. So people can actually consult and talk more about security or security instances. So that's all I have to share or comment on this topic.

>> PAUL WILSON: Thank you. Again, please remember, the mic is open. So anyone who has thoughts, suggestions, contributions, please feel free.

>> I want to -- I want to say about the cyber security theme -- knowledge of cyber security is not --.

>> PIRONGRONG RAMASOOTA: The point is all of you who doesn't have the head set, ask for the headsets from the interpreters so that we'll be able to translate simultaneously, but as you don't have it, I'll have to do it consecutively, so if there's any wrong things --

>> PAUL WILSON: They can still see the transcript on the wall here, even if he speaks in the language.

>> What do you mean?

>> PAUL WILSON: So we can have a Thai speaker fine and for those of us who can't speak Thai, there's the translation on the transcript. Sure, go ahead in Thai.

>> PIRONGRONG RAMASOOTA: Please go ahead. Thank you. Please go ahead. That would be very much appreciated. Go ahead.

>> Can you please kindly translate that, what he said?

>> PAUL WILSON: Please, yes. Go ahead. Please. Thank you.

>> Are you sure?

>> Yes.

>> Definite?
>> Yes. That's right.
>> I'm from university. Translated because it's not in Thai and so it's inaccessible to the Thais and some of them do have ideas, which for him, he couldn't express it out in English, but the point that he's here is because he thinks it's an open society and being an open society, well, I can speak in my own native language and you should all be able to listen to me. And the point is, I tried. It didn't work. And so I'm asking -- to do interpretations for me. Is.
>> The other point that he wanted to get across is that internet is a very important thing. It's about communications, and they need to have people who are in the authority to be able to be present around here. And it seems that there's not any authoritative people as far as internet in Thailand is concerned here at all. I mean, let alone speaking about the minister of information which if he thinks that Thailand is necessary to be in the Thailand foe, as they have already said, I don't want to say much because I could be arrested.
[APPLAUSE]
>> And I'm a civil servant. It's all right. I'm already retired. They can arrest me anytime.
[APPLAUSE]
>> And so there's no authoritative people from the government or from this state at all that are present here. And so this probably means that we're lacking people who could really might be helpful to us, as well.
>> PAUL WILSON: Okay, thank you very much. I think that's clear, and as I said, I think we want to mix it up and get help to do that. Thank you. Next.
>> If I can say something, I think it's interesting that he's been attending all the sessions and he's listening to us but we couldn't understand him. Come up to the microphone, make a simple one comment and we had this whole technical issues, the internet governance issues here. I think we should really appreciate him for taking the courage to come up to the microphone.
[APPLAUSE]
>> Good afternoon. I'll keep it very simple because I like simplicity, and I will try to do it in a tweet. So hashtag keep following the multistakeholder process. Hashtag work with us to build solutions for disasters, solutions for climate change but using ICTs and hashtag -- I think one of our fellows wanted me to say that we need to sort of include more -- from the Pacific countries to attend Asia Pacific IGF. And hashtag to all, welcome. Thank you.
[APPLAUSE]
>> PAUL WILSON: That's exactly the spirit. Thanks very much, Anju. Okay. Let's move along.
>> And hashtag to language diversity
>> PAUL WILSON: Sorry, we had one more?
>> When I walked in this hall and see secret police and he's sit down and take a photo, some people -- I didn't understand what my -- why they do it here. And I go to ask the staff. They say he just a secret security. I didn't understand. This is Thailand
>> PAUL WILSON: Okay, thank you.
>> I don't have a question, more of a comment. I tried

tweeting it, but I haven't seen my name come over the screen. So I'm going to wait for a while. I think we needed a dedicated session or sessions on disability and accessibility. And my question is what does -- what are the hurdles that the rest of us face when we want to talk about people with disabilities?

Because I don't think there are -- they shouldn't be taken as a burden but as a resource. Because their background, knowledge, skills, can help advance various technologies. This is not seen as a resource. And for example -- has been doing a lot of work in his field. It would be great if we had a few sessions that he could have spoken, organized. So maybe, I don't know -- maybe the organizers were facing some disabilities themselves to include -- not include someone like -- as a speaker or representer.

>> PAUL WILSON: Thank you. Good point. This session is for reflections and as much as we might like to enter into some deep discussions at this late stage, I think the point to hold these reflections and make sure we get back to them in due course by the next APrIGF, if not before. So let us move on, keep up the pace, moving on to digital economy and enabling invasion. I think we've got Wagas Hassan to speak. Please, over to you

>> WAGAS HASSAN: This is Wagas Hassan from Pakistan. I'll cut straight to the point. We had five workshops on digital economy and abling invasion to discuss the various -- model phones. There were also -- that was varying, and we ended up with the analysis of the -- but I'd like to speak to a few main -- but economic and financial system are due graphic incentivized. So the technology was faster than the economic, the social and the fascial and the others can catch up to it.

So the base of -- has to be fasten up, has to catch up with the technology and invasion that is happening around the world. And you know there are some issues over there, for regional economy, if you can't stress the payment system or whatever you are using that digital collection, it can't --

So in our view, we think that the only way forward is to have dialogue in multistakeholder, the dialogue that we are having right now on the APrIGF. And that is the key which can address the digital economic opportunities in the -- region. When we received that, you happen, the economic -- the -- in the market, they are really tough competition over there. But in the digital world and in the digital economy, we can see a very strong behavior of monopoly and legal --

So it is -- my own opinion at the moment -- situation. So we like to communicate, see this -- listen to this issue and also come up with some solutions as to how to attest this inherent disparity between this -- and the centralized nature of our economic and financial systems, thank you.

>> Thank you. I am

>> NUSRAT MEHAJABIN: First of all, emangement is e-commerce. That needs to be addressed directly because regular data, social media data, those data protection policies and data management, especially when we are considering how to forget the data, needs to be different in e-commerce. So that was a key point. And then there was and case based on career -- and the panelists said that a major issue was the convenience of the users because they had a convenience issue while using the identification card. However, in my country, Bangladesh acquired the card in the main hurdle. Because acquiring the ecard is a manual

process. It's not an eprocess, right? So that's a difficulty over there and another thing I would like to add, that is online advertisements should contribute to internet governance.

That is, online advertisements decides their earning from those advertisements. So the site could mandate the advertisements to promote internet governance. They can display short messages within the advertisement so that's a suggestion from us. And I would like to thank my other group members for helping us to summarize. That's all for me. Thank you. I'd like to beg your pardon, but I have to catch an early flight, so I'd like to take your leave. Thank you.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PAUL WILSON: Thank you.

>> AFIFA ABBAS: Afifa Abbas very good afternoon. I'm Afifa Abbas from Bangladesh. So in last few days, I have been attending the digital economy and invasion discussions. So I found those discussions a bit advanced and of course very useful. So I'll be actually highlighting a few of the recommendations that came up from the discussions and will try to blend it with my technical cards. So a few of the recommendations were to make the digital economy more efficient, we have to get out of the legacy ICT tunes. We need to implement the latest ICT tools to make it more efficient because we all know that in the evolving area of **tonal**, what was efficient yesterday may not be efficient today or tomorrow, so we need to work on that.

The second recommendation that came up from one of the discussion was to ensure that every citizen has -- every citizen participants efficiently in digital economy. We need to make sure that each of them has access to the internet. And being from technical background, by employing ICT, we can assure that.

There are a few issues we're running out. Those were common for a few economics, but those have been resolved already. But there are few economies still who are having the IPCV six issues that are unique. Like in my country, I'm having those issues.

So I think we need to identify those unique problems. Problems. We need to sit with the government and the top management of the companies to work things out.

The third recommendation that came up was enabling invasion. Invasion starts with internet. So if someone having a great idea but he doesn't have the access, he won't be able to contribute in digital invasion -- digital economy and invasion. And there's also the other side of the coin. If someone has the access but doesn't know how to contribute to digital economy, we can bring them into the frame of capacity building and development program to help him out, to mix together his knowledge and to implement in future. Thank you.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PAUL WILSON: Thanks, Afifa Abbas and thanks to the group, as well. So that's digital economy and enabling invasion. Any comments from the floor? And we also welcome any local participants who like to make comments in Thai, as well. No comments? Okay. Please, with the microphone.

>> I'm sorry. I am from ITF Indonesia, and believe me, I'm enjoying the this only one month before I don't know about IGF. And I have been recruit. I have no idea about IGF. And my idea of IGF asked me to learn to Bangkok and now I know more about IGF. But before, they ask me also to write a book, a pocket

book about IGF, which is I don't know how to write it. But now I think after I came here, it's really interested about IGF, and also about the complexity of it.

I think it's how to communicate. To communicate and transfer information to the facility yacht about IGF. And for that, also, Indonesia will doing the national IGF on October, which is in close time. And in close time also, I have to learn a little about IGF. But I'm searching a lot from internet more and more. And for my vision, after I attend a lot of classes, which is give me a confused. But I understand, again, it's about communication. And now I will go pack to Indonesia and writing a book about IGF. And then we're also going to info to other university student and we're doing it for the road map. About digital economy. That's our theme in a national IGF. It's about digital economy and sovereignty. Sorry, my English is not good.

And also the transformation of digital. That's what we talk -- we are talking about in our IGF national dialect. And now before I'm flying back tonight, I would like to ask how am I put my proposal -- it's not about funding or everything, not -- I mean not castle, whatever. But we try to minimize the government involvement in this area because now I know, and even though I don't know idea, I've been into community and a lot of -- a lot of community that I've been to it's like NGO, which is like I have an experiment.

So please give me the way to put my -- to run -- to run the IGF more better and to communicate IGF mostly to Indonesia and also I would like to do the road map of to work with the -- and to the gender school, last we would like to do, Jules. Thank you

>> PAUL WILSON: Thank you very much. I hope to say a few words towards the end of the session that will answer a couple of your questions. Thanks. So let's move on. Over to you, sonni.

>> Yes, the next is human rights and online, starting with Nica Dumlao from Philippines

>> NICA DUMLAO: Thank you, I would like to recognize our teammates for putting up this -- putting together the inputs from sessions. We have eight sessions in the different subthemes. We will be sharing the key takeaways from each session.

Place the burden on women to take preventive measures or the people who are experiencing online harassment, take preventive measures in terms of security or self centering themselves, discussion about shifting that burden to words -- it was also -- social media -- viewing themselves as -- relaying information -- other than content regulators. And then there was this discussion about consent regulation and the sort of implications on freedom of speech and other issues that can arise when tackling online harassment.

It was recommended that we not only suggest solutions about reporting and these sort of specific --

>> PIRONGRONG RAMASOOTA: Can I just request you to just -- we're running out of time. Thanks.

>> PAUL WILSON: We're going to need to move into --

>> NICA DUMLAO: Yeah, we'll try to -- so we have -- I'm the key takeaways for the three -- landscape of freedom of expression in India, Malaysia -- impact of how these repressive laws impact southeast Asia and journalists. The resulting overview of

international standards on right of expression and how to approach this -- oh, how to approach this in an international context. And actually, the was based on research that one project -- impact project conducted.

There was also sharing of successful proposal of having one single gateway in Thailand. And there was a relatively successful campaign against it. Recommendations was -- no engagement at all or the draft laws are not public. And -- cybercrime loss or -- provide ready weapons of political partners, parties to clamp down against their enemies. So we have to be careful in forcing cybercrime laws or legislating cybercrime laws. Also, there should be independent to monitor consistent enforcement of laws RRN arbitrary interpretation.

So another session is access the rights online digital for disenfranchised digital communities. So they have -- they discussed about internet access in women's em, FOOSHLT and digital skills in education. So one of the things they talked about is actually the reason why majority who are off line is women, it's because high cost of -- online. And there were also barriers, women facing expressing freely online and there's also -- how to participate online.

Another is the -- they talked about -- sorry.

They talked about the right better addressed by privacy laws and as the right to be forgotten can assist enforcement of other privacy rights in that, yeah, other privacy rights. And I think that's there's a lot of debate against, you know, the publicness and right to be forgotten, but that's just about it.

>> PAUL WILSON: Thank you.

>> NICA DURLAO: We have a last speaker.

>> SHIVANI LAL: So one interesting session we had was on how to make economic social and cultural right more visible in the discussion on internet rights, and especially discuss and impact the issues and challenges we face at civil society and how do we basically make more representation of these rights in forums like this. So one of the hacks, if you will, was suggested that because economic social and cultural rights are relatively easier and less control issue rights to deal with so we can have more engagement on these issues with the government

And secondly, a very important major recommendation through that session was to have more representation and push participation from indigenous groups because we're talking about culture and diversity. So this was -- I will keep it short

>> PAUL WILSON: Thank you, Shivani Lal. Any comments from the floor? Yeah? Appreciate it if you can keep it short, please.

>> We appreciate that there are in the human rights sessions there has been an emphasis on freedom of expression and the right to privacy, especially in the context of southeast Asia. And I'd just like to echo the civil declaration, why freedom of expression is important in southeast Asia. The right to freedom of expression is a fundamental right, for as human beings, we yearn to express our own humanity.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PAUL WILSON: Thank you. Yes, go ahead, please.

>> The reason why I'm here is I must admit I've never known IGF before, but I saw this notice about this activity and here I am and I feel a small part of IGF but I don't know whether you have members or memberships that will allow me to participate in future activities of IGF. And the idea that was put out just

now, saying that Thailand, when you have the computer coming out or cyber laws coming out or laws that control the use of social media, I said, I think perhaps the document should be made for people to propose some amendments or corrections. I think that's a good idea because the laws in our country are like a software with so many bugs, you need to debug them.

[APPLAUSE]

>> Okay, I just want to share on the human rights relative to the subtopic. We're organizing -- it's here. I'm sorry. So we're organizing a digital rights cam. So if you want to talk more about human rights online, engage my organize -- in October in Indonesia. You can check our page. You will know --

>> PAUL WILSON: Thank you, Nica Dumlao. Youth internet governance forum. I invite Sky Law. Would you and your group just cover the take of this, please. Thank you.

>> SKY LAW: I would like to recap some of the works we have achieved this year for IGF. As usual, we have days of event with interactive activities for our participants to get to know more about each other, the program, and the basic understanding of internet issue. Meanwhile, we are also join the newcomers capacity today together with APrIGF in the afternoon. Role play discussion is one of the core elements of IGF. For this year, the topic of discussion is launching the privacy protection bill within the Congress. Participants are divided into three, focusing on three topics, which is the freedom of speech, the right to be forgotten, and advertising strategy.

They are recommended to propose an action plan for their own committee for the conquest to discuss. The main goal of this role play discussion is to let our participate to taste attention, discussion when it comes to the situation that include multistuccotas. They have to communicate with each other when dealing with disagreement, just like in reality. Politics is about making consensus to find the -- that generally accepted by the others. Internet governance is also the same. We have encouraged our participants at our outcomes to desensitize the document and take further steps why IGF programs have been more integrate into APrIGF main conference while we have such intensive debate on our own topic.

Every participate has at least attended five workshops. At the same time, we as the organizer of APrIGF have also successfully submitted the proposal for the topic on social media to IGF and the workshop was accepted. We will bring your discussion outcome there, as well.

Last but not least, I will take this opportunity for thank you for your conscientious support to let voice be heard. One said, times change and we change with time. We believe we can work together and support each other on the issue of social media in the near future. Thank you very much.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PAUL WILSON: You can pass it on, quickly if you have anything else to add onto what Sky Law said

>> ANNA LIZ THOMAS: Thank you to net mission for organizing such a great program. It was a really good program, especially because the discussion was complimented by the workshops we were attending and we got information from all of these workshops that went into our action plan initiative that we all give as committees for the right to difficulty in the social media and advertising community, as well as the freedom of speech

community. And these communities were also serving in connection with the teams of the event. So yeah, it was a really good learning experience. And thank you for this opportunity.

>> PEERARUST SIRIAMPHAN: First of all, I want to thank everyone at IGF because before IGF I never knew about internet governance and I learn that internet governance is important to us all and we can contribute to internet governance and also we're going to be -- tomorrow. So when we know the internet governance now, we know how to -- we know how to plan it for the future. Thank you.

[APPLAUSE]

>> FELIZ FRANCISCO: First and foremost, I'd like to thank the entire people, the organizers for giving us the opportunity to attend this event. Basically we were given simulation game during one of our days and it was called data war wherein we realized that trading the companies we were running we would have to trade or sell data amongst each other in order to earn profit. At the end of the game, we didn't really think of the gravity of the situation until our organizers explained to us that it was so easy for you guys to sell and trade your information as if they were pieces of candy. And then that's when some of us realized, oh, if we could do this, there's a high chance that even companies themselves, the actual companies, could actually do -- so it kind of brings us or gives us a realization. As youth, we don't really think that way yet. So for this opportunity, especially for that simulation game that the organizers gave us, it really gave us a really good insight. That is all. Thank you.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PAUL WILSON: Comments?

>> Everything has gone to every room, but it hasn't been able to do so because what we have -- and so we're able to get all of the comments and ID'S and things that are quite far -- it's actually the -- to any of us. And it's from the world. And -- so -- so what is being discussed here is that we are being looked after equally and it's easier to get access. What I would like to comment is that this is a very -- things that are very far from us. So how is it that we'll be able to make things easier so that maybe a diagram or infographic so that it makes all of the contents that are serious to be easy enough to be able to comprehend and so that we will be able to have access to a large community. Thank you very much for making this -- and thank you for coming over to Thailand.

[APPLAUSE]

>> -- please.

>> SRIVANIS CHENDI: We have one more comment.

>> Just one comment, please don't mind my comment. I thought it would appear on the screen and people would be able to see it, but I think it's not coming up and I should see it. So far, what I can see among these recommendations, it seems like, as I said yesterday, it seems like you suggest -- civil society, sure. And people are sharing their world's views of only -- thinks about their rights. But I haven't seen a single comment -- sharing their thoughts, what your governance views are -- share a little bit about that perspective. I think government has a stay -- strong -- I can't see -- technical community, business community. I can just see that civil

society is here and there is. I would like APrIGF to be in support of IGF to work on it and incur that vision. Thank you.

>> SRIVANIS CHENDI: Though there are few technical folks here, but yes, it's not that great participation. Indeed. Next is the synthesis document. Sorry, we have comments? Sorry, I didn't see that.

>> Sorry. It's not a comment, but it's a question. I'm just -- we had -- before we came here, fellows were, we were doing this models, introduction to internet governance and I believe some of my colleagues would be interested to know, are we getting -- for that? Because we spent one month, that is June. So I'm just interested to know

>> SRIVANIS CHENDI: A good comment. I need to pass that on to the secretariat or someone. Do they get a certificate for doing that course, the fellows? Thanks.

>> RAJNESH SINGH: So in response to that question, I guess, you will. Your mod it's would have sent you an assessment. If you pass the assessment, you will get the certificate

>> SRIVANIS CHENDI: Thank you, Raj. And if they didn't pass the assessment, they can take the course again. Okay, you can take the course again.

>> I think it's -- if the people talking about some of the technical community or the people not coming here, I think it's a very critical and very important that people over here can -- organize the workshop. Because if nobody organizes a workshop to invite them to participate in, then we cannot do anything. Because as you know, all the workshop is as we are not control. We actually depend on the people propose the workshop. And the group, we are -- reviewing the workshop. And so if you would like to move government or tech no community to come into the APrIGF, do it and ask the people you know. Thank you

>> SRIVANIS CHENDI: Thanks. I think that's a good comment. National IGFs are the schools maybe can talk to the governments and technical company to bring the proposals for the APrIGF in future. Thank you.

Synthesis document.

>> MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you. Before I go into that, I would like to say one of the chairs of the fellowship committee. And I'm very proud of the passion and interest that our fellows have actually demonstrated and their participation during the week and their presentations today. And I'm sure that my colleagues will be very pleased with themselves. Thank you.

[APPLAUSE]

>> MAUREEN HILYARD: Just going on the synthesis document, just some takeaways from me. We had two town hall sessions and for me, I felt that there was a really strong call for the inclusion of capacity building as another separate area -- topic area, and especially incorporating the views of the -- and I think that our young people here have just been a real credit to that idea of making sure that they're included. But also, one of the things that really came out was that the document may have to be restructured a bit. We need to actually have a section in it.

We're looking at multi-- a multipurpose of this particular document, and it needs to have a section that milts the high level requirements of the global IGF. But because of the interest of the participants, that the report also needs to reflect the views of the participants in a way where the

language and the format of it will enable it to be used as a capacity -- capacity building resource. So we need to -- so that it's actually something useful to take back to the communities. And we need to ensure that we include the issues as they impact on the people within our region, and especially with respect to people with disabilities.

And specific concerns, as have been raised by our report repertoires here relating to access, security, privacy, human rights and the other topics that were raised.

I do have one particular request and that is that we need more volunteers to make sure that they are actually here to -- I mean they're actually with us and participating in that development of the document to make sure that it does reflect what is being asked for by the community. So that's very important. So if you haven't volunteered already, please do. You just have to send your names to Yannis and Jennifer, and we'd really appreciate your contribution.

But one final thing that I'd actually like to say, I hope you don't mind, is that I have to recognize the year in representative for the global IGF. And we actually -- I just want to raise on behalf of Jennifer, who actually ran a really amazing NRI session, where we're looking at national regional initiative and national initiatives. And one of the important things was that there are so many national IGFs, sort of like happening. And I think that's a real credit to what we're doing -- what the APrIGF is doing. And that's building more interest and more development of internet governance within our region. Thank you.

>> Would you stand up, please.

[APPLAUSE]

>> SRIVANIS CHENDI: Thanks. And Maureen, is the synthesis document still open for comments?

>> MAUREEN HILYARD: Yeah, I think Jennifer said she would leave it open for about another week so that we -- you know, if you haven't already made a contribution, especially the fellows, we would really like to actually get something from you. And the platformers comments?

>> As I promise you, I already checked the website and it is totally accessible. Congratulation to the APrIGF and you can only access this by using the -- et cetera, thanks.

>> SRIVANIS CHENDI: Thank you. That's good to know. Comment here?

>> A very quick, this synthesis document, I'm wondering is that a **XHUSHGZ** strategy based on the to communicate the messages, discussions to the public in a society? Because now it's not just about the policy makers, civil society and workers, it's concerning everyone in the society, make it ownership to the public because I understand in the Asia Pacific on the newspaper, and social media discussion, it's part of discourse. I also want to thank everybody again. We have gained so much -- and a wonderful event. Some insight for Asia Pacific contribution to our ongoing project defining indicator. Really, thanks to all of you.

[APPLAUSE]

>> SRIVANIS CHENDI: Thank you. So the Asia Pacific regional round table,

>> CHARLES MOK: Charles Mok yes, I'll stand up. I'm Charles Mok and I'm speaking on behalf of the Asia Pacific regional

legislators round table. In fact, many years ago I was just like one of you attending all these meetings. Right now, my row is a legislator in Hong Kong and there are a few things about being legislators. First is when you've given the floor, even when somebody put up the 0-minute sign, I'll keep ongoing.

Second, it's that if you invite four legislators to come to a meeting in Thailand, you will be very lucky if one show up and I'm the one. In fact, the -- the fact is, of course, legislators, because of all the government commitment and many times last minute meetings, it's very difficult for us to arrange the schedule and so on. So understandably, a few of them weren't able to make it in the last minute and actually a representative from Taiwan, he was really trying to get on the flight last night but because of the typhoon, he couldn't make it. But Jace was very kind to actually be in a video in our online meeting this morning and share with us many of the updates from Taiwan.

Now, in our views, the legislators round table could play a very important role to be the bridge between civil society and government. I realize that, you know, the young person from Thailand was just talking about, you know, why there were no government people in these kind of meetings. But in fact that's what we're trying to do. The roles of legislator, often times they're seen as part of government. But in fact, many of us are not technically part of government because we actually have the role of monitoring the government or legislating. But technically, we are not part of the administration in most of the political systems around.

In fact, there's a unique opportunity we hope that have given the facts that there are and will be more and more people from this community becoming members of your parliament and your legislature in future. This would be a good opportunity for us to establish this sort of platform. Now, for example, this morning, we were talking about in Taiwan the situation with the governments, legislature in areas such as digital economy and also in the area of cyber security. It would be very nice if there are laws in cyber security to catch all the bad guys, but at the same time, we are very worried that there will be overreaching power by the government. So where is the voice of civil society in that process? Legislators across different regions, if we have the opportunity to talk to each other, to understand what's going on in all this different territories, it will be very useful.

What next? What we are trying to do is we are going to be drafting, hopefully drafting a statement from the legislators' point of view. We've had a lot of these internet users statements before, but I think it will be a very unique opportunity for us to voice out legislators to the community to the internet governance community, to tell them from our point of view what government should do.

And we are targeting that hopefully we will get something done by IGF in the end of the year in Geneva, and I hope that as a final call, if any of you in your jurisdiction, you know of legislators in your country, your region, that they would be interested in this sort of efforts that you know, please recommend or introduce them to me and to Edmond. I think we will be very interested to get in touch with them and also work with them in future. Thank you.

>> SRIVANIS CHENDI: Thank you, Charles. Any last comments from the floor? Just a short one. No. If not -- keep it short, please.

>> Very short. Because there are things workshop organizer is here, I will recommend you, when you do the workshop organize in the next time, don't put all the same group of people together. Put a different people in your workshop. That will make your workshop more exciting

>> SRIVANIS CHENDI: Thank you. I think we've come to the end of this wrap-up session. It was a little experimental. We had a mixture between tweets and longer presentations, but that was fine. I think fantastic consent. Fantastic energy and a really great commitment from everyone here. So could we all give the panelists a round of applause.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PAUL WILSON: So we are going to move straight into closing remarks now, and we just have a short series of closing remarks before we wrap up the APrIGF for this year. And first, we have -- to **dainty** youth theme, we have closing remarks from Sherry Shek, our youth IGF organizer.

[APPLAUSE]

>> SHERRY SHEK: Good afternoon, everyone. It's a great honor for me to stand here today and to deliver a closing remark on behalf of youth. I'm sherry. That mission ambassador and also the organizer of Y IGF this year. It's my pleasure to share with you my belief in youth power in internet governance.

I started my engagement in internet governance with that mission. The beginning phase was a hard time for me since I as an English major was met by all sorts of technical terms like neutrality, digital inclusiveness and so many more in the workshops.

And I told my friends about what I was doing, they react in the same way. They were all shocked, asking why, like, what are you doing with this IT stuff? And in their compressing set, they think the discussion regarding internet are only for the IT people. However, I believe that youth shouldn't be excluded from the discussion of internet governance.

The stakeholder approach try to cater as far as possible the interest of every stakeholder and it's advocated in internet governance. One of the major **issues** of this internet ecosystem is also -- to its development. One youth fellow told me this morning, she thinks that sometimes youth might not be -- to joint discussion, which requires sort of knowledge, professional terminology and wealth of experience.

However, the engagement in conferences encourages them to further study. And finally, link them to make the inference.

I'm very excited to see that the emphasis on youth engagement has been growing. Various regions is a local Y IGF. We have entered our second year to promote internet governance to high school students. Our mission team continuously works on any possible way to push forward. The discussion of internet governance among youth so they can be empowered and contributed the development of internet.

This year, we have some key achievements. In this year's Y IGF, we have expand the diversity of our youth fellow. Our youth fellows come from 12 economies and there is a nearly balance gender proportion. To integrate with APrIGF, youth fellows also joined the main sessions. In total, they've join

around half of the workshops and participated in the synthesis document discussion. We concluded our four days program with a future initiative session in which actions were suggested to -- in their economies.

Many of them reached out to organize a local youth organization in their economies to look for collaboration with locals. Internet governance won't be stopped on regional level. These omitted the workshop -- how the social media ship our mind to the coming IGF this year.

We are very glad it has been settled and we will bring the discussion outcomes of Y IGF to there and continue the discussion on global level. Our youth fellows have been outspoken and demonstrated their eagerness towards internet governance. I would like to offer you to continue supporting youth engagement and I'm sure youth's power will not stop magnifying. Thank you.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PAUL WILSON: Thank you very much. Next speech from the local host, so I would like to welcome PIRONGRONG RAMASOOTA vice president of the Chulalongkorn University.

>> PIRONGRONG RAMASOOTA: Thank you, Paul. Good afternoon. Or is it good evening? Sorry.

So it's been both educational and enjoyable playing host to this event, which is I'm playing host to all of you who I believe have been brought here together with a more common concern, which is the future of the internet. Being hosts, we are preoccupied with two things, access and quality. So I hope we have rendered you with access to wi-fi, electricity, and food in the past three days.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PIRONGRONG RAMASOOTA: Notice I put wi-fi and electricity before food.

Access to knowledge, discussion, translation, and of course Thai hospitality. Sorry we could not get you access to any booze, because it's against the law passed by our military to be selling any alcohol within 300 meters from educational institutions.

And of course we hope that our dedicated staff who have worked tirelessly day and night, even weeks and months before you get here have impressed you with the quality of everything you have access to at the conference.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PIRONGRONG RAMASOOTA: Having lived under a military regime for the past few years, we learn to adjust to ways communication have been controlled. So we consider the fact that we have been able to host this conference, which has been live broadcast online throughout the past three days quite freely and smoothly, a small sign of success. And evident that freedom still remains on university campus and in the English language, which the HOONTA is not so fluent in.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PIRONGRONG RAMASOOTA: Let me assure you there's no secret police. What happened is as we tried to achieve inclusivity with free registration and also free food, we have unfortunately attracted a good of free riders who enjoy eating our conference food and getting free gifts of conference. Actually, there are people who make a living this way. So after we spotted quite a few of them loitering in the area, designated area, we alerted

campus security who dispatch a few plain clothes security staff, not police. They are campus security staff, but they are in plain clothes. Since because the report that there have been cases of stealing in the past -- in past conferences. So as host, we need to ensure that inclusivity goes hand in hand with security of our participants.

In any case, I'd like to thank all involved in making these past few days a success. My heroes and herrings are all the supporting staff at Chulalongkorn university.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PIRONGRONG RAMASOOTA: Mainly the folks at the center of communication center at Chulalongkorn university, the IT stat, everybody who worked tirelessly in the IT, the transportation people, human resource, who take care of the food and the catering, and all the staff who have remained with us despite the fact this is a holiday. Yesterday was a holiday. This is king's birthday. Big hand to all of them. And all the students, staff, we have the students, 30 students have been recruited from different faculties and they have also worked tirelessly in the past few days.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PIRONGRONG RAMASOOTA: And also my colleague and also assistant to the president.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PIRONGRONG RAMASOOTA: He has been helping manage this conference, together with ATIF. Okay, you know. He's been involved with Y IGF. And all of them have made this into a fruitful conference and I'm so thankful to all of them. Thank you very much.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PIRONGRONG RAMASOOTA: And as a token of this honor we have been given, I would like to present to Paul the APrIGF Bangkok flag. We had this specially made.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PIRONGRONG RAMASOOTA: So that he could pass on to the next host, like passing the torch. And also we have a little gift from Thailand so that Paul, who I have heard is outgoing, will remember us by.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PIRONGRONG RAMASOOTA: So thank you Paul for everything and thank you for hosting this

>> PAUL WILSON: Thank you

>> PIRONGRONG RAMASOOTA: And I hope to see all of you if I make it there. Okay, bye-bye

>> PAUL WILSON: Thank you so much for that kind speech and the kind gifts to be passed on to the next host. I suppose everyone's aware by now of the next host, the APrIGF 2018 will be held in Vanuatu in August next year. That's in the Pacific islands. I don't know if we have a slide to illustrate what a beautiful place it is. Unfortunately, they couldn't join us here to welcome you all, but you will be welcome and all the details are going to be coming up in due course, very soon.

So just a few final remarks from me as the chair of the multistakeholder, but I really would like to again thank the sponsors of this event and the hosts, Chulalongkorn university and the NBTC. I thought a really successful APrIGF number eight. I think every year, they've got better and better each year, and I really hope that you have all seen that here in

Bangkok. We've had a lot of focus in this session on the actual consent and proceedings of the event and a few interesting questions and suggestions about how the event should go in future. And I want to point out to each and every one of you that the future is in your hands, that as was pointed out, the program for the next APrIGF is yet to be seen. It will be developed under the oversight of the multistakeholder steering group, but it will be developed based on the proposals that come from the community.

So any and every one of you who would like to contribute to the consent next time, whether it's to encourage governmental participation, more civil society, technical community, new topics, whatever it is that you feel is important, please keep an eye out and participate in that process because the whole content that comes here to this event is crowd sourced from you.

If you'd like to go a little further, the multistakeholder steering group is quite an open group, as well, and if you would be interested to come into that group to help with the whole process of designing the next meeting of selecting the program, then that's open to you, as well. So I think on that note, we should all thank those that did the hard work last time, and I'm not talking so much about the MSG here but the people who put together the proposals, who came, brought the speakers, came and spoke and made the program what it was, I think very successful.

I'd also like to say thank you to you all individually for participating in what I think was one of the most interactive and participatory APrIGF's that I've seen and I really think that someone said before that some of the energy here has come from the fellows and the youth who have been here in great numbers and really helped to make this a meaningful event for all of us. So let's give us all collectively a round of applause for that contribution, please.

[APPLAUSE]

>> PAUL WILSON: It's been my privilege to chair the multistakeholder steering group for a few years now in a refinement of our procedures, we now have term limits, I'm very glad to say and I've come to the end of my term as the chair of the multistakeholder steering group. So I'd like to introduce the incoming chair, Rajnesh Singh. And what I would like to do is hand over to Raj as the incoming chair, the flag for the next event, and the --

[APPLAUSE]

>> PAUL WILSON: And for Raj, an opportunity to say a few words in closing this event. Thank you. It's yours.

>> RAJNESH SINGH: Thank you. Thank you, Paul. So first of all, it was remarked to me earlier, it was like Paul and myself had coordinated this morning. We're both wearing pink shirts. So yes, we did, we spoke. Actually, we didn't. I guess we did well.

So thanks very much to all of you. I must say that Paul has set a very high benchmark. He's been our chair for four years so I think it's been an interesting journey. I think we've seen the original IGF really grow in that time. So the benchmark for me has been set very high, but I think with my fellow members and of course Paul will remain on the MSV, for continued support and advice, we look forward to seeing where else we can take the IGF. I've been involved since the inception, and it's so great to see it grow and grow and grow. And I think this event here

in Bangkok, this is probably the best we've had so far. This year, the diversity in particular has been completely outstanding. So congratulations to everyone who was involved.

Ex, we're going to -- it's in the Pacific islands. Yes, it's going to be a bit far for some people, but we hope that it will have a different flavor. The region is very large, but I think there's a lot -- each subregion from this region can contribute. So let's see what we can do next year, but I'm sure it will be great again.

A lot of the speakers today talked about the multistakeholder model that served us well as the internet for many, many years. Really, it's how we define ourselves in many respects. However, I think we can't be complacent about that model. It's been used by many people now, the governments are using it, civil society is using it as a tool. But what we also see now is some people are trying to stop using it, trying to find alternative models to get what they want done.

I think from what we've seen, the multistakeholder model from the way the internet runs and operates, is governs, has worked and continues to work. But we cannot be complacent and say let's move on to something else. There's a transition for those of you involved with that. That's a process. Put what we see is some people seem to have -- including some governments, including some private sector plays. So my plea to you would be that please let's not be complacent about the multistakeholder model. We've got to keep working on it. The work is not done yet, and we look forward to all of you helping us along the way in making it happen.

So thank you very much. And again, thank you, Paul. Much appreciated. Thank you.

[APPLAUSE]

>> RAJNESH SINGH: So I guess this is the end. No, there's something else so we'll have to go to someone else. You were instrumental in setting up the regional IGF so come on up.

>> They said I have operated a sweat shop in the past month or so, so, you know, it comes back to me.

>> No, I wanted to make a point about Paul before -- and to say that Paul has done a really outstanding job. He turned the conference two parts to it. One is logistics and has done an excellent job. The wi-fi and food has been excellent, in that order. And Paul has been doing the program part of it, the community that did the programming. And the thing about this camelot is that we're all volunteers. So how do you motivate volunteers to do a good job, right? So you need an inclusive, really open leader to do that and Paul is outstanding in motivating the group to do a really outstanding job in the program. So if the programming is good, you know who to give credit to. It is Paul. And Raj is right, Paul has set a very high benchmark. And Raj, before you take on this leadership role, I have a statement for you. The statement is that you as chair of the MSG will act with justice, dignity, impartiality, represent us internally and externally and in all transactions act in the best interest of the APRIGF. Will you say I will?

>> RAJNESH SINGH: I will, I suppose. I don't have a choice.

[APPLAUSE]

>> But you come he didn't say that?

>> I didn't tell a new tradition.

>> RAJNESH SINGH: Okay. I'll have to remember that one. Thank

you for those comments. Are we done yet? Jennifer, are we done? That's the end. Thank you.
(Session concluded at 5:30 PM)